

WASHINGTON STATE HIGH SCHOOL ETHICS BOWL
SCORING CRITERIA

PLEASE NO HALF OR OTHER DECIMAL POINTS.

Presentations (up to 10 points total for each team)

- A) *Did the team clearly and systematically identify and thoroughly discuss the case's central ethical dimensions?* (up to 5 points)
- 5 = Clearly identified ethically relevant question(s) and thoroughly discussed key ethical dimensions.
 - 4 = Mostly identified and discussed in a reasonably clear way the key ethical dimensions of the case.
 - 3 = Adequately identified and discussed some key ethical dimensions, with significant dimensions missed and or part of the argument hard to follow (passable).
 - 2 = Misidentified and/or inadequately discussed some key ethical dimensions and/or demonstrated some serious problems in logic and/or reasoning (poor).
 - 1 = Incoherent presentation that ignored relevant ethical dimensions of the case.
- B) *Did the presentation indicate awareness and thoughtful consideration of different viewpoints, including those likely to loom large in the reasoning of individuals who disagree with team's position?* (up to 5 points)
- 5 = Insightful analysis of different viewpoints, including careful attention to differing viewpoints.
 - 4 = Solid analysis of different viewpoints, including careful attention to differing viewpoints.
 - 3 = Underdeveloped discussion of different viewpoints (passable).
 - 2 = Minimal consideration of different viewpoints (poor).
 - 1 = Minimal awareness of different viewpoints.

OPEN DIALOGUE (up to 10 points total for each team)

- 10 = Engaged in an exceptionally productive open dialogue with thoughtful attention to drawing out and responding to the views of the other team.
- 9 = Engaged in a reasoned, productive open dialogue with responsiveness to the other team's views.
- 8 = Thoughtful dialogue that addressed most of the relevant issues, with some dimensions missed.
- 7 = Several of the most important ethical issues were identified and discussed thoughtfully.
- 6 = Solid comments and responses, with some gaps or inconsistencies.
- 5 = Respectful of other team's point of view and engaged in the dialogue to some extent.
- 4 = Thoughtful dialogue, but team's line of reasoning was sometimes hard to follow.
- 3 = Respectful of other team's point of view but inconsistently engaged in the dialogue.
- 2 = Respectful of other team's point of view, but marginal engagement in the dialogue.
- 1 = Dismissive and/or combative in team's engagement with the other team's point of view.

RESPONSES TO JUDGES' QUESTIONS (up to 10 points total for each team)

- 10 = Exceptionally composed, complete, and thoughtful responses.
- 9 = Responded in a well-reasoned way to almost all the questions.
- 8 = Responded in a well-reasoned way to most of the questions, with some dimensions missed.
- 7 = Several of the most important points were identified and covered thoughtfully.
- 6 = Solid response to most of the questions, with some gaps or inconsistencies.
- 5 = Responded to most of the questions but line of reasoning was sometimes hard to follow.
- 4 = Responded to some of the judges' questions but line of reasoning was often hard to follow.
- 3 = Weak or irrelevant responses to most questions.
- 2 = Weak or irrelevant responses to almost all the questions.
- 1 = Failure to respond in any relevant way to any question.

HIGH SCHOOL ETHICS BOWL SCORE SHEET

Judge's Name _____

Round # _____

TEAM A _____

TEAM B _____

TEAM A PRESENTATION (5 minutes)

_____ A. Identification of central ethical elements
(1-5 points)

+ _____ B. Consideration of differing viewpoints
(1-5 points)

TEAM B PRESENTATION (5 minutes)

_____ A. Identification of central ethical elements
(1-5 points)

+ _____ B. Consideration of differing viewpoints
(1-5 points)

+ _____ **TEAM A OPEN DIALOGUE**
(10 points) (10 minutes)

+ _____ **TEAM B OPEN DIALOGUE**
(10 points) (10 minutes)

+ _____ **TEAM A RESPONSES TO JUDGES'**
(1-10 points) **QUESTIONS (15 minutes)**

+ _____ **TEAM B RESPONSES TO JUDGES'**
(1-10 points) **QUESTIONS (15 minutes)**

= _____ **TEAM A TOTAL POINTS**
(up to 30 points)

COMMENTS:

= _____ **TEAM B TOTAL POINTS**
(up to 30 points)

COMMENTS: